Stage 2 Application

CIHR 2014 Foundation Scheme “live pilot”

December 2014 – January 2015
The objectives of this session are to:

• Provide an overview of the Stage 2 application

• Provide an opportunity for participants to ask questions
Stage 1 Results

• Out of the 1366 applications peer reviewed, 467 applicants have been invited to Stage 2 of the Foundation Scheme competition process.

• It is anticipated that between 150-210 applications will be funded in this first pilot.

• A minimum of 15% of the funded grants will be allocated to new/early career investigators.
Stage 2 Application: Overview
Stage 2 Application

• The application at Stage 2 focuses on the caliber of the program of research and is distinct from the Stage 1 application.

• The reviewers at Stage 2 will not have access to the materials and reviews from Stage 1.

• A new pool of reviewers will be recruited for Stage 2; however, a small number of reviewers from Stage 1 may participate at Stage 2.

• Stage 1 reviewers recruited to participate in the review of Stage 2 applications would be assigned to review a different set of applications.

• Reviewers will be assigned to applications based on their expertise and field of research.
Stage 2 Application

• When submitting an application with other Program Leaders and Program Experts, each Program Leader and Named Program Experts have access and edit rights to the application.

• Program Experts are not expected to edit or contribute to the application other than to provide consent.

• Every Program Leader and Named Program Experts must agree to the general conditions governing grants and awards and consent to the disclosure of Personal Information by completing the appropriate task within ResearchNet.

• Once all of the mandatory tasks associated to the application are complete, the final step will require the Administrative Coordinator to agree to the terms and conditions on behalf of all of the applicants in order to submit the application.
Stage 2 Application

- In order to successfully complete a Stage 2 application, Program Leaders must:
  - Complete the Identify Participants task in ResearchNet by:
    - Updating their CIHR Foundation Scheme CV through the Canadian Common CV, as appropriate;
    - Identifying their Most Significant Contributions;
    - Updating their Career Contributions, as appropriate;
    - Providing consent.
  - Complete a summary of the research program.
  - Address each Stage 2 adjudication criterion by highlighting:
    - Quality of their Research Program:
      - Research Concept
      - Approach
    - Quality of the Expertise, Experience and Resources
      - Expertise
      - Mentorship and Training
      - Quality of the Support Environment
Stage 2 Application

Overview

1. Summary (1 page)

2. Quality of the Research Program (5 pages)
   2.1 – Research Concept (3 pages)
   2.2 – Approach (2 pages)

3. Quality of the Expertise, Experience and Resources (6 pages)
   3.1 – Expertise (3 pages)
   3.2 – Mentorship and Training (2 pages)
   3.3 – Quality of the Support Environment (1 page)
Program Leaders will also be required to:

- Complete the References section to support the research proposal.

- Outline the budget request and justify that the requested resources are appropriate to financially support the proposed research program.

- Attachments will not be allowed, with the exception of Figures and Tables.
Stage 2 Application

- Participants
- Summary
- Stage 2 Criteria
- Budget
Stage 2 Application

Participants  Summary  Stage 2 Criteria  Budget
As part of the Identify Participants task, each Program Leader must first specify their applicant type by identifying whether they are:

- Independent Researcher
- Knowledge User

The individuals identified as Program Leaders at registration cannot be changed (i.e. added or removed).

The Administrative Coordinator may also add Program Experts to the application, as appropriate, by entering their:

- First and last name;
- Validated CIHR PIN.

The Administrative Coordinator will then identify each Program Expert’s type:

- Independent Researcher
- Knowledge User
- Trainee
- Other
Participants

- The Administrative Coordinator will also identify if the Program Expert should be named on the application.

- Named Program Experts will be required to provide their consent in ResearchNet before the Administrative Coordinator can submit the application, as their name will be included in CIHR’s funding decisions documents.

- As Program Experts named on the application may change during the life span of the program, it will be possible to add or remove Program Experts to the grant at a later date to suit the evolving needs of your program.

Stage 2 Application Instructions are available on the CIHR website. They provide a detailed breakdown of what you should consider including when developing your application.
The Foundation Scheme CV should be updated to reflect the purpose of this stage.

The Quick Reference Guide and Requirements document for the CIHR Foundation Scheme CV are available on the CIHR website.
Stage 2 Application Instructions are available on the CIHR website. They provide a detailed breakdown of what you should consider including when developing your application.
• Complete a summary as part of the Stage 2 application.

• This summary should not be a re-submission or update of the Stage 1 summary, as you must now summarize the research program.

• This summary will be used for three main purposes:
  • Assist in matching expert reviewers to the application;
  • Allow reviewers to declare their conflicts and ability to review, and will be included in the reviewers’ application package;
  • Will be published in the Funding Decisions Database, which will allow CIHR to communicate funding results.

• The summary should be written using scientific or technical terms.

Stage 2 Application Instructions are available on the CIHR website. They provide a detailed breakdown of what you should consider including when developing your application.
• Using a maximum of 3500 characters (approx. 1 page including spaces), describe the research program.

• Make sure to describe the overarching direction.

• To do so, ask the following questions:
  • How will your anticipated results advance knowledge, health care, health systems, or health outcomes?
  • What expertise does your team have, and how will that benefit your proposed research program?
  • What are the proposed mentoring and training activities that will occur throughout your funded research program?

Stage 2 Application Instructions are available on the CIHR website. They provide a detailed breakdown of what you should consider including when developing your application.
Stage 2 Application

Participants
Summary
Stage 2 Criteria
Budget
Quality of the Program

• Part of the Stage 2 application focuses on the Quality of the Program, which accounts for 40% of the reviewers’ overall assessment.

• The Quality of the Program is represented by two equally-weighted sub-criteria within the application:
  • Research Concept (20%)
  • Approach (20%)

• Reviewers will assess the research concept and the approach (in terms of the scope of the program) in the context of your career stage, field of research, and in the context of other conceptual factors that are specific to your research field.

Stage 2 Application Instructions are available on the CIHR website. They provide a detailed breakdown of what you should consider including when developing your application.
Research Concept (20%)

• This criterion is intended to assess:
  • The research component of your program, as well as the significance of its anticipated outcomes.

• Within a maximum of 10 500 characters (approx. 3 pages):
  • Articulate your proposed research program.

• To do so:
  • Outline your program goal, its objectives, and its potential impacts. These should be well-defined and appropriate given the nature and scope of the research program;
  • Illustrate a conceptual coherence within your research program;
  • Describe the significance of the potential program outputs;
  • Illustrate how these outputs are likely to significantly advance health-related knowledge or its translation into improved health care, health systems, or health outcomes.

Stage 2 Application Instructions are available on the CIHR website. They provide a detailed breakdown of what you should consider including for this sub-criterion.
Research Approach (20%)

• This criterion is intended to assess:
  • The quality of the research approach of your proposed program.

• Within a maximum of 7 000 characters (approx. 2 pages):
  • Articulate your research approach.

• To do so:
  • Illustrate a well-planned, appropriate approach, poised to deliver on the objectives of your research program;
  • Outline any potential challenges to the approach, as well as the mitigation strategies that could be employed to overcome these challenges;
  • Include a high-level description of how the progress and success of your program will be measured;
  • Demonstrate how the approach allows for flexibility in direction as the program evolves.

Stage 2 Application Instructions are available on the CIHR website. They provide a detailed breakdown of what you should consider including for this sub-criterion.
Quality of the Expertise, Experience & Resources

• Part of the Stage 2 application also focuses on the Quality of the Expertise, Experience, and Resources, which accounts for 60% of the reviewers’ overall assessment.

• The Quality of the Expertise, Experience, and Resources is represented by three equally-weighted sub-criteria:
  • Expertise (20%)
  • Mentorship and Training (20%)
  • Quality of the Support Environment (20%)

• Reviewers will assess:
  • The expertise and experience;
  • The mentorship and training of the applicants described in your grant application (Leaders and Experts);
  • The quality of the support environment in the context of your career stage (in terms of the scope of the plan), your field of research, and in the context of other conceptual factors that are specific to your research field.

Stage 2 Application Instructions are available on the CIHR website. They provide a detailed breakdown of what you should consider including for this sub-criterion.
This criterion is intended to assess:

- Both your and your proposed Program Experts’ expertise and experience, and whether it is collectively sufficient to deliver on the objectives of the proposed program.

Within a maximum of 10,500 characters (approx. 3 pages):

- Outline the relevant experience and collective expertise being assembled (disciplinary, professional, or methodological experience or expertise);
- Describe how they are appropriate to ensure the delivery of the objective of the proposed research program;
- Include a high-level description of your expertise and experience, as well as that of the other Leaders and Experts.

To do so:

- Demonstrate an appropriate level of engagement or commitment from key Program Experts;
- Include a plan to seek out expertise from new Program Experts based on the anticipated future needs of the research program required.
Mentorship and Training (20%)

- This criterion is intended to assess:
  - The quality of your mentorship and training plan, which will demonstrate your commitment to shaping the future of your students, trainees, emerging scholars, and new or early career investigators, as well as other individuals in non-academic, health-related fields.

- Within a maximum of 7,000 characters (approx. 2 pages):
  - Articulate a mentorship and training plan.

- To do so, outline:
  - The rationale of the proposed training approach;
  - The potential challenges of the training or mentorship plan;
  - How the progress and success will be measured.

Quality of the Expertise, Experience & Resources

Stage 2 Application Instructions are available on the CIHR website. They provide a detailed breakdown of what you should consider including for this sub-criterion.
Mentorship & Training (20%)

Your plan should:

- Outline your methodology for building capacity and positioning students, trainees, knowledge users, emerging scholars, or new or early career investigators for successful research careers or other career paths in non-academic health-related fields;

- Clearly demonstrate the training goals, learning opportunities, and key activities, and the benefits of the activities and target audiences;

- Demonstrate an appropriate and innovative approach for meeting the proposed plan’s objectives in relation to your research program and your research field;

- Include a strategy for identifying and mitigating potential challenges for recruiting, retaining, or mentoring/training graduate students, trainees, emerging scholars, new or early career investigators, and/or health-related professionals.

Stage 2 Application Instructions are available on the CIHR website. They provide a detailed breakdown of what you should consider including for this sub-criterion.
Quality of the Support Environment (20%)

- This criterion is intended to assess:
  - Whether you have the resources necessary in order to successfully deliver on the objectives of our research program in both the short- and long-term.

- Within a maximum of 3500 characters (approx. 1 page):
  - Outline the resources you have access to that will ensure the successful delivery of your research program objectives, including access to environments in other organizations, if applicable.

- To do so:
  - Demonstrate how the described environments are appropriate to enable the conduct of your proposed research program, and to manage and deliver on its objectives and key components (research, knowledge translation, or mentorship and training) through the provision of, or access to, the required infrastructure, such as:
    - Physical infrastructure;
    - Support personnel;
    - Equipment;
    - Specialized facilities;
    - Supplies.

Stage 2 Application Instructions are available on the CIHR website. They provide a detailed breakdown of what you should consider including for this sub-criterion.
References

• References are not included within the character limits dedicated to the application content. There is a dedicated section to include references.

• In this section, you are able to capture any references cited within your application, for example, your bibliographical information.

• This section is limited to a maximum of 7 000 characters (approx. 2 pages including spaces).

Stage 2 Application Instructions are available on the CIHR website. They provide a detailed breakdown of what you should consider including when developing your application.
Attachments

- Figures and Tables are the only attachments allowed within the Stage 2 application.

- Figures and Tables must directly support your research program and should not serve as a means to include supplementary information.

- All non-allowable attachments will be removed by CIHR staff prior to being assigned to reviewers.

Stage 2 Application Instructions are available on the CIHR website. They provide a detailed breakdown of what you should consider including when developing your application.
Stage 2 Application

Participants  Summary  Stage 2 Criteria  Budget
• The budget request is intended to assist peer reviewers in determining the appropriate funding levels for individual research programs.

• The budget requested will not be factored into the overall assessment of the application.

• The period of support requested for the Foundation Scheme is 5 years for new or early career investigators, and 7 years for all other applicants.

Stage 2 Application Instructions are available on the CIHR website. They provide a detailed breakdown of what you should consider including when developing your application.
• Outline your budget request and justify that the requested resources are appropriate to financially support the proposed research program as described in your application.

• To complete the Foundation Scheme budget request, complete the following four steps:

  1. Provide an overview of the funds that you currently hold (or have held in the past 7 years) from CIHR and/or other funding agencies;
  2. Indicate the amount that is required in each budget category, along with a concise, high-level description of what the funds will be used for, in order to support the amount requested;
  3. List any funding from partners (cash and/or in-kind support) that has been secured, or is expected to be secured; and
  4. Provide a justification for the appropriateness of the funds requested to support the proposed program of research, including specific justification for any request that is higher than the amount of funding currently held from CIHR and/or other funding sources.

Stage 2 Application Instructions are available on the CIHR website. They provide a detailed breakdown of what you should consider including when developing your application.
1. Establish Budget Baseline

- You are required to establish a budget baseline based on your funding history. This information will be considered as part of the evaluation of your Foundation Scheme budget request.

- If your budget request exceeds the baseline amount, a justification for the additional amount requested must be provided.

- To establish this baseline:
  - Provide an overview of your past relevant funding history from CIHR and/or other funding organizations;
  - Only enter the funding history for relevant sources of funding, where you are a Principal Investigator (i.e. NPI or PI), with an end date of no earlier than February 5, 2008.
  - Enter actual awarded grant amounts (not requested amounts).

- For applications with multiple Program Leaders, only the funding history of jointly held grants can be listed (e.g., grants held where all Program Leaders are Principal Investigators).

Stage 2 Application Instructions are available on the CIHR website. They provide a detailed breakdown of what you should consider including when developing your application.
1. Establish Budget Baseline

- The grants included in this section are not expected to be a comprehensive list of your entire funding history. The complete funding history can be found within the Foundation Scheme CV;

- Only include grants that are relevant to establishing your historical budget baseline amount in order to inform your budget request (e.g., Open CIHR funding, other operating funding);

- Funding that is not relevant such as training/salary award support (e.g., Fellowships Award, New Investigator Award), large strategic initiatives (e.g., STIHR), NCE funding, etc. should not be included.

Stage 2 Application Instructions are available on the CIHR website. They provide a detailed breakdown of what you should consider including when developing your application.
1. Establish Budget Baseline

In order to establish your baseline amount, refer to the option that applies to your background:

A) Applicants with an existing CIHR Open Funding history

B) Applicants with no CIHR Open Funding History

C) New/Early career investigators

D) Applicants who are applying jointly (multiple Program Leaders)

Stage 2 Application Instructions are available on the CIHR website. They provide a detailed breakdown of what you should consider including when developing your application.
1. Establish Budget Baseline

A) Applicants with an existing CIHR Open Funding History

- Your budget request should be consistent with the average amount of CIHR funding from Open Grant Programs that you have held in the past.

- The CIHR open funding history should be used to establish the baseline amount for the Foundation Scheme budget request.

Stage 2 Application Instructions are available on the CIHR website. They provide a detailed breakdown of what you should consider including when developing your application.
1. Establish Budget Baseline

B) Applicants with no CIHR Open Funding History

- The appropriateness of your budget request should be justified in the context of your past funding history, for example CIHR Strategic Funding or NIH.

- This funding history should be used to establish the baseline amount for the Foundation Scheme budget request.

Stage 2 Application Instructions are available on the CIHR website. They provide a detailed breakdown of what you should consider including when developing your application.
1. Establish Budget Baseline

C) New/early career investigators

- New/early career investigators may not have enough of a funding history to establish a meaningful baseline.

- Therefore the budget request may exceed the declared baseline amount.

Stage 2 Application Instructions are available on the CIHR website. They provide a detailed breakdown of what you should consider including when developing your application.
1. Establish Budget Baseline

D) Applicants who are Applying Jointly

- If you are applying **jointly** with other Program Leaders, you may only include funding that has been held jointly in order to establish your baseline amount.

- This funding history should be used to establish the baseline amount for the Foundation Scheme budget request.

Stage 2 Application Instructions are available on the CIHR website. They provide a detailed breakdown of what you should consider including when developing your application.
2. Budget Categories

- Indicate and justify the required amounts to support your proposed research program by:
  - Entering the requested amount for each budget category for the entire period of support (not yearly amounts).

- Budget categories:
  - Research Staff;
  - Trainees;
  - Consumables;
  - Non-Consumables;
  - Knowledge Translation;
  - Other

- Equipment is an allowable expense.

Stage 2 Application Instructions are available on the CIHR website. They provide a detailed breakdown of what you should consider including when developing your application.
2. Budget Categories

• Within a maximum of 900 characters, complete your requested budget by:
  • Describing how the amount requested for each applicable category aligns with the requirements of your proposed research program.

• CIHR will disburse funds in equal yearly instalments.

Stage 2 Application Instructions are available on the CIHR website. They provide a detailed breakdown of what you should consider including when developing your application.
3. Partners

- Program Leaders can add partners in the optional Identify Application Partners task and upload a signed letter of support from said partners.

- Afterwards, they must include budget information in the Enter Budget Information task in ResearchNet for every partner named, which includes specific incremental cash or in-kind contributions being provided in support of the proposed program of research.

- Add partner information prior to completing the budget task.

Stage 2 Application Instructions are available on the CIHR website. They provide a detailed breakdown of what you should consider including when developing your application.
4. Budget Justification

- If your budget request exceeds the baseline amount, justify the appropriateness of your request in the context of your past funding history.

- This applies to new/early career investigators. While new/early career investigators may not have enough of a funding history to establish a meaningful baseline, they will still be required to provide additional justification for the increased request.

- This section is limited to a maximum of 1750 characters (approx. half a page including spaces).
Consent and Submit

- Participants on the application must consent before the Administrative Coordinator can submit the application to CIHR.

- Every Program Leader and named Program Experts must provide their consent.

- Once every task is complete, the Administrative Coordinator must review the terms listed and respond to the questions regarding consent in order to submit the application.

- The Administrative Coordinator will then click "Submit to Research Institution" and the application will be sent to the Institution Paid as part of the eApproval process and ultimately, CIHR.

- Once CIHR receives your application, you will receive an email confirmation.

Stage 2 Application Instructions are available on the CIHR website. They provide a detailed breakdown of what you should consider including when developing your application.
Decision Process

- Stage 2 is the final application stage in the Foundation Scheme competition.

- After your Stage 2 application has been received by CIHR, it will undergo a review process by expert reviewers.

- Once all reviews are submitted to CIHR, a notice of decision will be provided to all Stage 2 applicants.

- You will be informed that either:
  - Your application remains in the peer review process; or
  - Your application received a low ranking and has been deemed unsuccessful in this competition.
Decision Process

- Applications remaining in the peer review process will move to the Final Assessment Stage and be subject to a face-to-face discussion by interdisciplinary committee members covering the full spectrum of health research.

- The Committee will be responsible for integrating the results of the Stage 2 reviewers, with a focus on assessing ‘grey zone’ applications.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Applicant</th>
<th>Stage 1 Consolidated Rank Order</th>
<th>Rev 1</th>
<th>Rev 2</th>
<th>Rev 3</th>
<th>Rev 4</th>
<th>Rev 5</th>
<th>Std Dev</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A Smith</td>
<td>1/567</td>
<td>1/22</td>
<td>1/17</td>
<td>1/15</td>
<td>1/11</td>
<td>1/8</td>
<td>7.82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N Smith</td>
<td>2/567</td>
<td>2/17</td>
<td>2/12</td>
<td>1/11</td>
<td>3/13</td>
<td>1/11</td>
<td>6.59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C Smith</td>
<td>3/567</td>
<td>3/12</td>
<td>2/15</td>
<td>1/11</td>
<td>3/11</td>
<td>2/9</td>
<td>8.51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R Smith</td>
<td>4/567</td>
<td>1/10</td>
<td>2/8</td>
<td>4/11</td>
<td>3/14</td>
<td>1/15</td>
<td>10.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E Smith</td>
<td>5/567</td>
<td>4/11</td>
<td>2/6</td>
<td>1/9</td>
<td>3/10</td>
<td>1/19</td>
<td>12.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>...</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K Smith</td>
<td>249/567</td>
<td>15/17</td>
<td>2/12</td>
<td>3/11</td>
<td>9/13</td>
<td>9/11</td>
<td>21.74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S Smith</td>
<td>251/567</td>
<td>6/10</td>
<td>6/6</td>
<td>3/11</td>
<td>5/14</td>
<td>11/15</td>
<td>17.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X Smith</td>
<td>252/567</td>
<td>4/10</td>
<td>3/17</td>
<td>6/11</td>
<td>1/14</td>
<td>7/7</td>
<td>17.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>...</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O Smith</td>
<td>564/567</td>
<td>17/17</td>
<td>15/15</td>
<td>10/10</td>
<td>9/11</td>
<td>6/6</td>
<td>8.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L Smith</td>
<td>565/567</td>
<td>20/21</td>
<td>14/14</td>
<td>9/10</td>
<td>9/9</td>
<td>8/9</td>
<td>6.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M Smith</td>
<td>566/567</td>
<td>19/19</td>
<td>17/17</td>
<td>10/12</td>
<td>8/8</td>
<td>8/8</td>
<td>3.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D Smith</td>
<td>567/567</td>
<td>20/20</td>
<td>19/19</td>
<td>12/12</td>
<td>9/10</td>
<td>15/15</td>
<td>7.52</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

“Green Zone” Applications (Applications that will be funded)

“Grey Zone” Applications (Applications that will move on to the Final Assessment Stage)

Applications that will not be funded
There are a number of resources available on CIHR’s website:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Applicants and Research Administrators</th>
<th>Reviewers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Funding opportunity</td>
<td>Peer Reviewer Manual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application Instructions for Stage 2 (budget instructions included)</td>
<td>Interpretation Guidelines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quick Reference Guide for the Foundation Scheme CV</td>
<td>Stage 2 Peer Review Webinars</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foundation Scheme Stage 2 Application (training module)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stage 2 information sessions (December 2014 and January 2015)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questions &amp; Answers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Questions regarding the Foundation Scheme Competition can be directed to: Roadmap-Plan.Strategique@cihr-irsc.gc.ca