

CIHR’s Adjudication Scale for the 2014 Pilot Competitions

Below is an overview of the rating scale used for the 2014 pilot competitions and the associated numerical values developed to generate a preliminary ranking of the applications. To generate the preliminary ranking, ResearchNet converts the rating assigned to each sub-criterion into the associated numerical value and multiplies it by the established weighting for the sub-criterion. These values are then summed and ranked from highest to lowest.

Changes to the scale were implemented as a result of previous pilot results. Analysis of the pilot outcomes along with feedback from peer reviewers recommended that CIHR should avoid using a scale with an established understanding (e.g., A, B, C, D, E); demonstrated that the bottom of the scale is rarely used; and noted that the top end of the scale would benefit from added granularity. Feedback from University Delegates was also gathered to inform the development of the scale. As part of the pilot competitions, the usefulness of the scale will be assessed and modifications made if required.

The scale was developed taking the following principles into account:

- The ratings are a tool to rank applications
- The scale needs to apply to all types of criteria
- Abbreviations need to be simple for ease of tabulation/reference

Descriptor	Abbreviation	Definition	Numerical Value
Outstanding	O ⁺⁺	For this sub-criterion, the application excels in most or all relevant aspects. Any short-comings are minimal.	28
	O ⁺		26
	O		24
Excellent	E ⁺⁺	For this sub-criterion, the application excels in many relevant aspects, and reasonably addresses all others. Certain improvements are possible.	22
	E ⁺		20
	E		18
Good	G	For this sub-criterion, the application excels in some relevant aspects, and reasonably addresses all others. Some improvements are necessary.	12
Fair	F	For this sub-criterion, the application broadly addresses all relevant aspects. Major revisions are required.	6
Poor	P	For this sub-criterion, the application fails to provide convincing information and/or has serious inherent flaws or gaps.	0