POLITICAL SCIENCE 5301A COMPARATIVE THEORY Phone 494-6606

Robert Finbow Room 301B A & A Email: finbow@dal.ca

This course explores some of the principal theoretical approaches used in the study of politics in different countries. As a companion to the course on Approaches to Development, it focuses primarily, but not exclusively, on theories applicable to advanced industrial states. It begins with a discussion of important paradigms in political analysis, highlighting principle debates about the focus and nature of political science and ideological disagreements over the actual and desirable nature of the state. It then covers selected theoretical tools used to analyze specific elements of comparative politics, notably interest groups and corporatism, institutionalism, feminism, political culture and ideology, revolutionary change, democratization, development and dependency. It concludes by asking whether we are moving beyond an era of state-centred politics, and beyond the division between the sub-fields of Comparative Politics and International Relations. Throughout, an effort will be made to compare and analyze how competing paradigms in the field treat each topic.

STUDENT ASSIGNMENTS:

Seminars will feature student debates and discussion. The final grade will be determined by participation (20%), 2 presentations (20% each), and research essay (15-20) pages (40%). Essay topics should be agreed to with the instructor by **October 24th** at the latest. Essays will be due on **December 12th**.

As this is a small seminar, students are expected to participate actively in discussions and to attend all classes. Students will be expected to volunteer for 2 assignments as presenters to make up 40% of the final grade. One to two presenters (depending on numbers enrolled) will be needed for each week. A list of debate topics will be circulated in the near future. Students should present a paper on ONE of the two themes we will cover, one in each half of the class. While students are initially invited to select topics of their preference, a balance across topics will be essential. Student presentations should take the form of a debate argument on the principal themes of the assigned articles. Presenters' statements should not exceed 10-15 minutes in length..

Presenters should submit a written version of their presentation each week, in the form of a formal essay of no more than +/- 10 pages. A copy of these papers should be made available two working days before the seminar to the instructor and the class, to serve as the basis for seminar discussion. This should be sent as email attachments and will be posted on the course page. When there are two presentations, presenters should coordinate their participation before preparing their papers, to ensure that the assigned readings are covered and the debate topic is thoroughly explored. A list of proposed debate themes or propositions is attached.

REQUIRED READINGS:

There is one required textbook for this course: J. Dryzek and P. Dunleavy, *Theories of the Democratic State* (2009). It is available from the Dalhousie Bookstore. Several chapters are taken from E. Cudworth, T. Hall and J. McGovern *The Modern State: Theories and Ideologies* (2007) which can be purchased optionally from Amazon.ca or other retailers. Most articles and chapters will be made available on the **OWL online learning system.** Some chapters and articles will be available from the course mailbox in the POLI department office. A list of topics and readings (required and recommended) follows.

PART 1: FUNDAMENTAL APPROACHES

Paradigms and Precursors in Comparative Politics

Required:

Dryzek and Dunleavy, ch. 1.

"The Role of Theory in Comparative Politics: A Symposium" World Politics, Vol. 48, (October, 1995), 1-49,

especially section by Evans, Hoeber-Rudolph.

Howard J. Wiarda "Is comparative politics dead? Rethinking the field in the post-Cold War era" Third World Quarterly; Dec 1998; 19, 5.

Gerardo L. Munck "The Past and Present of Comparative Politics." Kellogg Working Paper #330 – Oct. 2006.

Mark Lichbach and Alan Zuckerman, "Research Traditions in Comparative Politics" in O'Neil et. al. (eds.) *Essential Readings in Comparative Politics* New York: Norton, 2005.

Timothy Lim "Thinking theoretically in Comparative Politics" in T. Lim. Doing Comparative Politics: An Introduction to Approaches and Issues 2nd. Ed. (Boulder: Lynne Reinner, 2010).

*Book on order

Recommended:

Mark Lichbach "Social Theory and Comparative Politics" in Lichbach and Alan Zuckerman (eds.) *Comparative Politics: Rationality, Culture and Structure* Cambridge MA: Canbridge University Press, 1998, 239-76.

Barbara Geddes "Paradigms and Sand Castles: Theory Building and Research Design in Comparative Politics" (Forthcoming, University of Michigan Press.)
JA 86 G35 2003- Killam Library Reserves

Howard J Wiarda "The death of the great international systems debate?" Reconceptualizing comparative politics World Affairs; Spring 1999; 161, 4;

Ronald Chilcote, *Theories of Comparative Politics* Chapters 1-4. JF 51 C44- Killam Library Reserves

Howard Wiarda New Directions in Comparative Politics Chapters 1-2

T. Kuhn, *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions* especially introduction and conclusion.

Louis Cantori and Andrew H. Ziegler, *Comparative Politics in the Post-Behavioural Era*, p. 5-22, (Neumann), 54-70 (Lijphart).

Functionalism and Systems Theory

Cantori and Zeigler, p. 97-112 (Easton); p. 77-91 (Almond and Powell).

Allan Larson, Comparative Political Analysis Chapters 3, 4.

Chilcote, p. 121-49.

G.A. Almond and G.B. Powell, "The Systems Approach", & S.E. Finer, "A Critique of the Systems Approach" in Paul G. Lewis and David C. Potter, *The Practice of Comparative Politics*

PART 2: SOCIETAL APPROACHES

Pluralism and Neopluralism

Required:

Dryzek and Dunleavy, chs. 2,6,7.

Cudworth, Hall and McGovern ch. 2, 5

Steven Lukes, *Power: A Radical View* 2nd ed New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005.

Recommended:

Grant Jordan, "The Pluralism of Pluralism: An Anti-Theory?" *Political Studies* Vol 38, No. 2 (June, 1990), p. 286-301.

Martin J. Smith: "Pluralism, Reformed Pluralism and Neopluralism: The Role of Pressure Groups in Policy-Making" *Ibid*, p. 302-322.

Charles Lindblom, "The Market as Prison," *The Journal of Politics*, Vol. 44, No. 2 (May 1982), 324-336

Murray Knutilla, State Theories (Toronto, Garamond, 1987), Ch. 4.

Nelson Polsby, *Community Power and Political Theory* (2nd. ed.), New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1980, 187-37.

Chilcote, p. 347-57.

J. Manley, "Neo-Pluralism: A Class Analysis of Pluralism I and Pluralism II" *American Political Science Review* Vol. 77, No. 1 (June, 1977).

Nelson W. Polsby "How to Study Community Power: The Pluralist Alternative" *The Journal of Politics*, Vol. 22, No. 3, (Aug., 1960), pp. 474-484

Charles Lindbloom, *Politics and Markets* (pages 107-200).

Neo-Marxist Theories

Required:

Dryzek and Dunleavy, ch. 4.

Cudworth, Hall and McGovern ch. 4.

Raju J. Das, "State theories: A critical analysis" Science & Society, 60, 1 (Spring 1996), 27-57.

Clyde W. Barrow, Critical Theories of the State Madison: U. of Wisconsin Press, 1993, Chs 1-2 and selectively

Recommended:

L Panitch, "Thoroughly Modern Marx." Foreign Policy 172 (May/June 2009), 140-145.

D. Gold Y.H. Lo, and E.O. Wright, "Recent Developments in Marxist theories of the capitalist state", *Monthly Review*, October-November, 1975, Vol. 27, issue 5

B. Jessop, "Recent Theories of the Capitalist State", Cambridge Journal of Economics Vol. 1, 1977

Boris Frankel, "On the State of the State: Marxist Theories of the State After Lenin", *Theory and Society* Vol. 7 (1979)

John Roemer, "New Directions in the Marxian Theory of Exploitation and Class" *Politics and Society* Vol. 11, No. 3, 1982, 251-287.

PART 3: STATIST APPROACHES

Elite Theory and The New Right

Required:

Dryzek and Dunleavy, chs. 3, 5, 12.

Cudworth, Hall and McGovern ch. 3, 8, 10

Recommended:

Borchert, Jens. "They Ain't Making Elites Like They Used To": The Never Ending Trouble with Democratic Elitism." *Comparative sociology* 8.3 (2009):345-363.

Domhoff, G.W. "Mills's The Power Elite 50 Years Later." Contemporary sociology 35, 6 (2006):547-550.

Timothy J. Gaffaney "Citizens of the Market: The Un-Political Theory of the New Right" *Polity*, Vol. 32, No. 2, (Winter, 1999), pp. 179-202

Desmond S. King, "New Right Ideology, Welfare State Form and Citizenship: A Comment on Conservative Capitalism," *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 30 (1998): 792-99.

A. King, "Overload, Ungovernability and Delegitimation: The Theories and the British Case" *British Journal of Political Science* 14, 2 (1984), 135-160

Knutilla, State Theories, Chptr 3.

Max Sawicky, "What's NewP? A Guiding Theory of the New Right", Social Policy, 22, 3 (Winter 1992), 7-19.

Norman P. Barry, "The New Liberalism", British Journal of Political Science 33, 1, 1983, 93-123.

Andrew Vincent "New ideologies for old?" The Political Quarterly 69, 1 (Jan-Mar 1998), 48-58.

M.E. Olsen, *Power in Societies*, 1970, Chapters by Pareto, Mosca, Michels, Olsen. HM 136 O4- Killam Library Reserves

R. Dye and H. Zeigler, The Irony of Democracy 1987, Ch. 1.

Corporatism and Neo-Institutionalism

Required:

Oscar Molin and Martin Rhodes, "Corporatism: The Past, Present, and Future of a Concept" *Annual Review of Political Science* 5, 1 2002, 305-31.

Phillipe C. Schmitter, "Still the Century of Corporatism?", Review of Politics (36,1) (January, 1974), p. 85-128.

Leo Panitch, "The development of corporatism in liberal societies", *Comparative Political Studies* (10,1) (April, 1977), p. 61-90.

Sven Steinmo "Institutionalism" in Nelson Polsby (ed.) International Encyclopedia of the Social and Behavioral Sciences. Elsevier Science, 2001

Ellen M Immergut "The theoretical core of the new institutionalism" *Politics & Society*; Stoneham; 26, 1 (Mar 1998), p. 5-34

Recommended:

Alan Cawson, "Pluralism, Corporatism and the role of the State", *Government and Opposition* (13, 2) (Spring, 1978), p. 178-98.

Douglas Chambers, "Corporatism and Comparative Politics" in Howard Wiarda (ed.) *New Directions in Comparative Politics*

Cantori and Zeigler, pages 134-156 (Chambers)

Thelen, Katherine, "Historical Institutionalism in Comparative Politics" *Annual Review of Political Science* 1999 369-404.

Hall, Peter A; Taylor, Rosemary C R; "Political science and the three new institutionalisms" *Political Studies* 44, 5 (Dec 1996), 936-957.

Theda Skocpol "Why I Am an Historical Institutionalist" *Polity*, 28, 1, (Autumn, 1995), pp. 103-106

E. Nordlinger, "Taking the State Seriously" in S. Huntington and M. Wiener (eds.) *Understanding Political Development*

PART 4: GENDER, IDENTITY AND CULTURE

Feminist Political Theory

Required:

Dryzek and Dunleavy, ch. 10.

Cudworth, Hall and McGovern ch. 9.

Janet Siltanen and Michelle Stanworth "The Politics of Private Woman and Public Man" *Theory and Society* Vol. 13, 1 (Jan. 1984), p. 91-118.

Recommended:

Catherine Mackinnon, "Feminism, Marxism, Method and the State: An Agenda for Theory" *Signs: Journal Of Women in Culture and Society* 7:3 (Spring 1982), 515-544.

LA Haney "Feminist State Theory: Applications to Jurisprudence, Criminology, and the Welfare State" *Annual Review of Sociology*, Vol. 26: 2000 641-666.

Lorraine Code Encyclopedia of feminist theories London: Routledge, 2000.

Rosemarie Tong, Feminist Thought: A More Comprehensive Introduction Ch. 1, Conclusion and selectively.

Carole Pateman, "Feminism and Democracy" in Graeme Duncan (ed.) Democratic Theory and Practice, 204-17.

Nancy Fraser, "Feminism, Capitalism, and the Cunning of History," *New Left Review* 56 (March/April 2009), 97-117.

Melanie Randall, "Feminism and the State: Questions for Theory and Practice" *Resources for Feminist Research*, Vol. 17, No. 3, p. 10-16.

Marianne Hirsch and Evelyn Fox Keller, *Conflicts in Feminism* Introduction, Chapters 8, 9.

Political Culture, Identity and Ideology

Required:

Dryzek and Dunleavy, ch. 8.

William M. Reisinger "The renaissance of a rubric: political culture as concept and theory" *International Journal of Public Opinion Research* 7, 4 Dec 1995, 328-352.

Ronald Inglehart "The Renaissance of Political Culture" *The American Political Science Review*,. 82, 4 (Dec., 1988), 1203-1230.

Thomas R. Bates "Gramsci and the Theory of Hegemony," *Journal of the History of Ideas* Vol. 36, No. 2, Apr. - Jun., 1975, 351-366.

G. A. Almond, "The Intellectual History of the Civic Culture Concept", in: G. A. Almond, S. Verba *The Civic Culture Revisited* (Boston: Little Brown, 1980), pp. 1 – 36.

Raymond Williams, "Base and Superstructure" in Lyn Spillman (ed.) *Cultural Sociology* (Blackwell Publishing, 2001) 56-61.

Recommended:

Raymond Williams, "Base and Superstructure in Marxist Cultural Theory", New Left Review, 82, 1973, 3-16

Ruth Lane, "Political culture: residual category or general theory?" *Comparative Political Studies* 25, 3 (Oct 1992), 362-387.

Chilcote, Chapter 6.

B. Jessop, *Traditionalism, Conservatism and British Political; Culture* Chapter 3, "Civility, hegemony and Stability"

Lucien W. Pye, "Culture and Political Science: Some Problems in the Evaluation of the Concept of Political Culture" *Social Science Quarterly* 1972, p. 285-96.

Carole Pateman, "Political Culture, Political Structure and Political Change", *British Journal of Political Science*, 1, 3 (July, 1971), p. 291-305.

PART 5: POLITICAL DYNAMICS

Revolutionary Change

Required:

Theda Skocpol States and social revolutions: a comparative analysis of France, Russia, and China

New York: Cambridge University Press, 1979). Intro, conclusion and selectively.

Or Theda Skocpol "State And Revolution: Old Regimes and Revolutionary Crises in France, Russia, and China" *Theory & Society* 7, 1-2(Jan/Mar1979), 7-95.

Jack A Goldstone, "Towards a Fourth Generation of Revolution Theory", *Annual Review of Political Science* 4, 1, June 2001, 139-187.

John Foran, "The Future of Revolutions at the Fin-de-Siècle" *Third World Quarterly*, 18, 5, (Dec., 1997), 791-820.

Recommended:

Jack A Goldstone, "Theories of Revolution: The Third Generation", World Politics. 32,. 3, Apr., 1980. 425-453.

John Foran, "Theories of Revolution Revisited: Toward a Fourth Generation?" *Sociological Theory* 11, 1, (Mar, 1993), 1-20.

Jeff Goodwin and Theda Skocpol, "Explaining Revolutions in the Contemporary Third World" *Politics and Society* 17, 4 (Dec., 1989), 469-509.

J. L. Himmelstein and M. S. Kimmel, "Review Essay: States and Social Revolutions: The Implications and Limits of Skocpol's Structural Model" *American Journal of Sociology*. 86, 5 (Mar., 1981), pp. 1145-1154.

William H. Friedland et. al., *Revolutionary Theory* (Totowa, NJ: Alllanheld, Osmun, c1982). (for Marxist analyses)

Development, Dependency and Underdevelopment

Required:

Piki Ish-Shalom, "Theory Gets Real, and the Case for a Normative Ethic: Rostow, Modernization Theory, and the Alliance for Progress" *International Studies Quarterly* 50, 2, (June 2006), 287–311.

Ramón Grosfoguel "Developmentalism, Modernity, and Dependency Theory in Latin America" *Nepantla: Views from South* 1.2 (2000) 347-374.

I Kapoor "Capitalism, culture, agency: dependency versus postcolonial theory" *Third World Quarterly*, 23, 4, 2002, 647–664.

John D. French, "Understanding the Politics of Latin America's Plural Lefts (Chavez/Lula): social democracy, populism and convergence on the path to a post-neoliberal world," *Third World Quarterly*, 30, 2, 2009, 349-370.

Recommended:

Tony Smith, "The Dependency Approach" in Howard Wiarda *New Directions in Comparative Politics* Boulder CO: Westview Press, 2002 Chapter 3.

Zaheer Baber, "Modernization theory and the cold war" *Journal of Contemporary Asia* 31, 1, 71-85.

Cantori and Zeigler, p. 355-415 (Huntington and Migdal).

Gabriel Almond, "The Development of Political Development" in Huntington and Weiner, p. 437-90.

Steven Topik, "Dependency revisited: Saving the baby from the bathwater" *Latin American Perspectives* 25, 6 (Nov 1998), 95-99

Richard A. Higgott "From modernization theory to public policy: Continuity and change in the political science of political development" *Studies in comparative international development* 15, 4 (Winter, 1980), 26-58.

Andres Velasco "Dependency Theory" in "The dustbin of history" Foreign Policy 133, Nov/Dec 2002, 44-45

Edwin Rhyne, "Dependency theory: Requiescat in Pace?" Sociological Inquiry 60. 4 Fall 1990, 370-.

Peter Evans, "Class, State and Dependence in East Asia: Lessons for Latin Americanists" in Frederic C. Deyo, *The Political Economy of the New Asian Industrialism* (Ithaca, Cornell University Press, 1987), 203-226.

Dudley Seers, ed. Dependency Theory: A Critical Reassessment, Chapters, 1,2,3,6.

Magnus Blomstrom and Bjorn Hettne, *Development Theory in Transition* Chapters 1,2,3,4,8.

PART 6 CONTEMPORARY TRANSFORMATION

New Social Movements/Post Modernism

Required:

Dryzek and Dunleavy, chs. 11, 13

Eduardo Canel "New Social Movement Theory and Resource Mobilization Theory: The Need for Integration" in M. Kaufman and H. Dilla Alfonso (eds.) *Community Power and Grassroots Democracy: The Transformation of Social Life* (Ottawa and New Jersey: IDRC and Zed Books, 1997) Available online at IDRC

Francesca Polletta1 and - James M. Jasper Collective Identity and Social Movements *Annual Review of Sociology* 27: 283-305 (doi:10.1146/annurev.soc.27.1.283)

George Steinmetz, "Regulation Theory, Post-Marxism, and the Transition from the New Social Movements to Anti-globalization and Far Right in Aram A. Yengoyan (ed.) *Modes of Comparison: Theory and Practice*, University of Michigan Press, 2006

Recommended:

Steven M Buechler, "New social movement theories" Sociological Quarterly, 36, 3 (Summer, 1995) p. 441-.

Nelson A Pichardo "New social movements: A critical review" Annual Review of Sociology Vol. 23, (1997) 411-430.

George Steinmetz, "Regulation theory, post-Marxism, and the new social movements" *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 36, Jan 1994, 176-.

Barry D. Adam, "Post-Marxism and the new social movements" *Canadian Review of Sociology and Anthropology*, 30, 3 (Aug 1993), 316-26.

Steven M. Buechler, "Beyond resource mobilization? Emerging trends in social movement theory" <u>Sociological</u> <u>Quarterly</u> 34, 1993, 217-.

Epstein, Barbara; "Rethinking Social Movement Theory" Socialist Review 20, 1 (Jan 1990), 35

Democratization and Globalization

Required:

Dryzek and Dunleavy, ch. 9, 14.

Giovanni Capoccia and Daniel Ziblatt "The Historical Turn in Democratization Studies: A New Research Agenda for Europe and Beyond" *Comparative Political Studies* 43(8/9) 931–968

D. Held, "Democratic Accountability and Political Effectiveness from a Cosmopolitan Perspective," *Government and Opposition*, 39, 2 (2004), 364-91.

Philippe C. Schmitter "Twenty-Five Years, Fifteen Findings" *Journal of Democracy*, 21, 1, January 2010, pp. 17-28.

Samuel P. Huntington "After twenty years: The future of the Third Wave" *Journal of Democracy* 8, 4 Oct., 1997, 3-12.

Recommended:

Jarle Simensen, "Democracy and Globalization: Nineteen Eighty-Nine and the `Third Wave'" *Journal of World History* 10, 2 (Fall, 1999), 391-411.

Dryzek and Dunleavy, ch. 15.

Philippe C. Schmitter, "Twenty-Five Years, Fifteen Findings," *Journal of Democracy*, 21,1, January 2010, 17-28.

Giovanni Capoccia and Daniel Ziblatt, "The Historical Turn in Democratization Studies: A New Research Agenda for Europe and Beyond," Comparative Political Studies 43(8/9) 931–968.

Kathleen C Schwartzman "Globalization and democracy" Annual Review of Sociology Vol. 24, 1998, 159-181.

Giovanni Carbone, "The Consequences of Democratization," Journal of Democracy, Volume 20, Number 2, April 2009, pp. 123-137

William Graf, "Democratization For The Third World: Critique of a Hegemonic Project" *Canadian Journal of Development Studies*, Special Issue 1996, 37-56.

Baohui. Zhang. "Corporatism, Totalitarianism, and Transitions to Democracy" *Comparative Political Studies*, Vol. 27, No.1 April 1994, pp. 108-136.

Fareed Zakaria, "The Rise of Illiberal Democracy" Foreign Affairs 76, 6. (Nov/Dec 1997), 22-43.

Lipset, S.M., "The Social Requisites of Democracy Revisited" *American Sociological Review*, Vol. 59, 1 (Feb., 1994), 1-22.

Samuel P. Huntington "How Countries Democratize" *Political Science Quarterly*, 106, 4 (Winter, 1991-1992), 579-61.

Samuel P. Huntington "Will More Countries Become Democratic?" *Political Science Quarterly*, 99, 2 (Summer, 1984), pp. 193-218

ESSAY TOPICS:

As graduate students you may to develop a topic of your choice, perhaps supportive of thesis research. It need not focus on the above themes, but can do so if you prefer, with additional research. The topic is subject to the following guidelines:

- 1) the principle theme must be the DOMESTIC politics of states other than Canada
- 2) there must be a THEORETICAL component: you must assess and test theories of domestic politics somehow in the essay
- 3) you may apply a RANGE OF THEORIES TO A SINGLE CASE to test their validity; or APPLY A SINGLE THEORY TO SEVERAL CASES to assess its general application; or consider various combinations of these approaches
- 4) Essays which focus primarily on theoretical themes can be considered if the theories are focused on domestic comparative politics
- 5) Transnational or inter-state approaches should only be employed to explain effects of global forces or on domestic politics. States do not exist in a vacuum, but there are plenty of opportunities in this department to explore IR themes in depth, and relatively few to examine domestic comparative politics
- 6) To be sure, do consult the professor, and prepare a topic statement or essay proposal by October 22nd.

STUDENT ACCESSIBILITY AND ACCOMMODATION

Students may request accommodation as a result of barriers related to disability, religious obligation, or any characteristic under the Nova Scotia Human Rights Act. Students who require academic accommodation for either classroom participation or the writing of tests, quizzes and exams should make their request to the Office of Student Accessibility & Accommodation (OSAA) prior to or at the outset of each academic term (with the exception of X/Y courses). Please see www.studentaccessibility.dal.ca for more information and to obtain Form A - Request for Accommodation.

A note taker may be required to assist a classmate. There is an honourarium of \$75/course/term. If you are interested, please contact OSAA at 494-2836 for more information.

Please note that your classroom may contain specialized accessible furniture and equipment. It is important that these items remain in the classroom so that students who require their usage will be able to participate in the class.

INFORMATION ON PLAGIARISM

All students in this class are to read and understand the policies on academic integrity and plagiarism referenced in the Policies and Student Resources sections of the academicintegrity.dal.ca website. Ignorance of such policies is no excuse for violations.

Any paper submitted by a student at Dalhousie University may be checked for originality to confirm that the student has not plagiarized from other sources. Plagiarism is considered a serious academic offence which may lead to loss of credit, suspension or expulsion from the University, or even to the revocation of a degree. It is essential that there be correct attribution of authorities from which facts and opinions have been derived. At Dalhousie there are University Regulations which deal with plagiarism and, prior to submitting any paper in a course, students should read the Policy on Intellectual Honesty contained in the Calendar or on the Online Dalhousie website. The Senate has affirmed the right of any instructor to require that student papers be submitted in both written and computer-readable format, and to submit any paper to be checked electronically for originality. As a student in this class, you are to keep an electronic copy of any paper you submit, and the course instructor may require you to submit that electronic copy on demand.