Bias in competency committee decisions

Joan Sargeant  PhD
Professor Medical Education
Dalhousie University

PGME CBME Workshop, April 3, 2018
Objective

• Explore potential for bias in CCC decision-making

Is bias conscious? Unconscious? Both?
STUDIES OF BIAS OUTSIDE MEDICINE (DICKENY 2017)

• “A study of judicial decisions found that after eating, court judges gave more lenient sentences.” They were unaware of this.

”Just altering the price of wine alters drinkers’ experience and neuronal activity.”
Sources of bias arising from committee structure (*Hauer et al*, 2016)

- Member characteristics - variability
- Committee size
- Information access and sharing procedures
- Leader characteristics and group skills
- Time pressure

- Gender, of committee members and residents - a new field of research? (European Commission, 2017 *Implicit gender biases during evaluations: how to raise awareness and change attitudes?*; upcoming RCPSC “Key Lime” podcast)
Examples of bias in decision-making processes of Competence Committees *(Dickey et al, 2017)*

- Anchoring
- Availability
- Bandwagon
- Confirmation
- Framing effect
- Groupthink
- Overconfidence
- Reliance on gist/ gestalt
- Selection
- Visceral - emotion
Strategies for Committees to help minimize the effect of bias on decision-making

• Awareness of potential biases
• Discussion by the Committee
• Questioning one’s own and each other’s decisions – what bias might this reveal?

• Role-playing scenarios