## "WHY CARE NOW?" IN FORCED MIGRATION RESEARCH

The transformation potential of a radical feminist ethics of care

© Christina Clark-Kazak, DPhil cclarkka@uottawa.ca

#### ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS



Thanks to Evie, Madeleine and workshop organizers

Funding from SSHRC

Anonymous peer reviewers

I live & work on unceded & unsurrendered Algonquin territory

## ROADMAP

Why care now? Towards radical care ethics
Why care now in forced migration research?
How can we care? Imagining an otherwise

## "WHY CARE NOW?"

Victoria Lawson, 2007 Presidential address, Association of American Geographers



## RADICAL CARE ETHICS

"Theorized as an affective connective tissue between an inner self and an outer world, care constitutes a feeling with, rather than a feeling for, others." Hobart and Kneese (2020: 1)

Response to critiques of "carewashing" (Chatzidakis et al. 2020) and Eurocentric and neoliberal perspectives (Tong 1998; Held 2006)

## RELATIONAL

- Care-fully consider our positionality within power asymmetries and privilege
- Relationships are interdependent, even in contexts of unequal power relations
  - Researchers need research participants; participants rely on allyship & long-term investment
- Building on concept of reciprocity in Indigenous ethics and epistemology

## PREVENTING HARM

#### critical epistemologies acknowledge power relations in the (re)production of knowledge

 explicitly and intentionally seek to dismantle harmful power structures as part of research design (self-)care mechanisms and processes within research process itself

 differential impact of research on participants, peer researchers, interpreters and contract researchers (often mislabelled as "research assistants")

## PRODUCTIVE WORK OF EMOTIONS

validates "gut feelings" and encourages researchers to explore why they react and care about certain issues and events

acknowledges the emotional labour required in research processes

"When mobilized, it offers visceral, material, and emotional heft to acts of preservation that span a breadth of localities: selves, communities, and social worlds." (Hobart and Kneese 2020, 1)

## WHY CARE NOW IN FORCED MIGRATION STUDIES?



## ETHICAL TURN IN MIGRATION STUDIES

- Since early 2000s, increased literature on ethics in migration
- CCR, CARFMS & CRS, Ethical guidelines (2017) French & English
- IASFM Code of Ethics 2018
- codified emerging best practices on migration research and:
  - voluntary, informed consent (Hugman, Bartolomei, and Pittaway 2011);
  - confidentiality (Kahn and Fábos 2017); and
  - "do no harm" (Mackenzie, McDowell, and Pittaway 2007; Hugman, Pittaway, and Bartolomei 2011; Stierl 2020)

## PRECARIOUS MIGRATION STATUS

Research can lead authorities to identify people who do not have formal status or documentation

Researchers can exacerbate vulnerability and surveillance for those with precarious status

Revocation of status, including citizenship, based on research findings

Most research participants are deportable; researchers usually are not

#### CRIMINALIZATION OF MIGRATION

Externalization policies make it difficult for people to enter legally to exercise their right of asylum

In some jurisdictions and in some professions, duty to report (self-)harm

Implications for privacy, confidentiality and informed consent

## SECURITIZATION



- Wide-ranging "anti-terrorist" laws and national security legislation (Guild 2003; Huysmans and Buonfino 2008; Savun and Ginest 2019)
  - People in migration face heightened surveillance and scrutiny
- Online data collection crosses jurisdictions & poses privacy issues

### POLITICIZATION



Cooperation into policy-based evidence-making (Stierl 2020; Clark-Kazak 2022; Baldwin-Edwards, Blitz, and Crawley 2019)

Over-researching can lead to research fatigue (Pascucci 2017; Omata 2019), especially when people are "captive audiences"

Research findings are scrutinized & taken out of context "in shadow of fear" (Bose 2020)

## EXTREME POWER INEQUALITIES

Dependence on government, NGOs & sponsors for legal status, services and livelihoods

# Calls into question voluntariness of consent

## HOW CAN WE CARE?

Imagining an "otherwise" (Povinelli 2012)



"That kind of parasitic relationship is that researchers are—I feel that researchers, they come get our data, then waste our time. There is no mutual benefit, the benefit is on one side. Those guys collect the data, and for us at the end of it we don't see any change. We expect to at least get some benefit back, but there is no benefit. You get your data, you go—maybe use it for your own benefit and you leave us hanging. So, I feel only one party is benefitting and the other one is not benefitting. So that's why I say it's kind of a parasitic relationship" (quoted in Bilotta 2019, 134)

## RELATIONAL INTERDEPENDENCE

- "A care ethics approach to research design also asks us to take seriously the ways in which our work is "for others" and to build connection and responsibility as key values in our research approaches." Lawson (2008: 6)
- "response-ability" (Martin, Myers, and Viseu 2015)
- Whose agenda?
- Greater use of participatory action methodologies and epistemologies
- "Nothing about us without us" representation and ownership

"We think that researchers take pride in our increasing problems in order to research more. ...We are still facing the same problems despite the number of researchers we have met." (cited in Karooma 2019, 18)

## PROACTIVE CARING – BEYOND DO NO HARM

- Invited allyship to amplify the experiences and priorities of those most affected by forced migration
- Speak out against injustice
- Think proactively about unintended consequences
- Expanding the duty of care to both participants & researchers
  - Especially researchers who are from the communities and/or in contract employment without office space, health insurance, etc.
- Self-care, not in neoliberal sense, as "radical praxis" and "collective survival within a world that renders some lives more precarious than others" (Hobart and Kneese 2020: 5)

"My friend the professor!" exclaimed one of the participants in the PhotoVoice session about to begin, "What do you have for us this time? What do you want to learn about? What we eat? Where we go? How we get there? I hear you want us to take some pictures, is that right? What are you going to do with them? Hey, as long as you give us those giftcards, right? I'm trading you these stories for a giftcard, am I right? But they're still my stories and you gotta do right by me when you tell them." (cited in Bose 2020, n.p.)

## References

- Baldwin-Edwards, M., Blitz, B.K., & Crawley, H. (2018). The Politics of Evidence-Based Policy in Europe's 'Migration Crisis'. Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, 45(12), 2139–55. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2018.1468307</u>
- Bilotta, N. (2019). Navigating Ethical Terrains: Perspectives on "Research Ethics" in Kakuma Refugee Camp. Montreal, Canada: McGill University Libraries.
- Bose, P.S. (2020). Refugee Research in the Shadow of Fear. GeoJournal, 87, 195–207.
- Chatzidakis, A., Hakim, J., Littler, J., Rottenberg, C., & Segal, L. (2020). From carewashing to radical care: the discursive explosions of care during Covid-19. Feminist Media Studies, 20(6), 889–895. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/14680777.2020.1781435</u>
- Clark-Kazak, C.R. (2021). Ethics in Forced Migration Research: Taking Stock and Potential Ways Forward. Journal on Migration and Human Security, 9(3), 125–138. <u>https://doi.org/10.1177/23315024211034401</u>
- Clark-Kazak, C.R. (2022). Crossing Methodological and Disciplinary Boundaries. In K. Grabska & C.R. Clark-Kazak (Eds.) Documenting displacement: questioning methodological boundaries in forced migration research. McGill-Queen's University Press.
- Guild, E. (2003). International Terrorism and EU Immigration, Asylum and Borders Policy: The Unexpected Victims of 11 September 2001. European Foreign Affairs Review, 8, 331–46.
- Held, V. (2006). The Ethics of Care: Personal, Political, and Global. Oxford University Press on Demand.
- Hobart, H.J.K. & Kneese, T. (2020). Radical Care: Survival Strategies for Uncertain Times. Social Text, 38(1), 1–16. <u>https://doi.org/10.1215/01642472-7971067</u>
- Hugman, R., Bartolomei, L., & Pittaway, E. (2011). Human Agency and the Meaning of Informed Consent: Reflections on Research with Refugees. Journal of Refugee Studies 24(4), 655–71.
- Huysmans, J. & Buonfino, A. (2008). Politics of Exception and Unease: Immigration, Asylum and Terrorism in Parliamentary Debates in the UK. Political Studies, 56(4):766–88.

## References

- Kahn, L., & Fábos, A. H. (2017). Witnessing and Disrupting: The Ethics of Working with Testimony for Refugee Advocacy. Journal of Human Rights Practice, 9(3), 526–533. <u>https://doi.org/10.1093/jhuman/hux036</u>
- Karooma, C. (2019). Research Fatigue Among Rwandan Refugees in Uganda. Forced Migration Review 61, 18–9.
- Lawson, V. (2008). Geographies of Care and Responsibility. Annals of the Association of American Geographers, 97(1), 1-11.
- Mackenzie, C., McDowell, C. & Pittaway, E. (2007). Beyond 'Do No Harm': The Challenge of Constructing Ethical Relationships in Refugee Research. Journal of Refugee Studies, 20(2), 299–319.
- Martin, A., Myers, N., & Viseu, A. (2015). The politics of care in technoscience. Social Studies of Science, 45(5), 625-641. https://doi.org/10.1177/0306312715602073
- Omata, N. (2019). 'Over-Researched' and 'Under-Researched' Refugees. Forced Migration Review, 61, 15-8.
- Pascucci, E. (2017). The humanitarian infrastructure and the question of over-research: reflections on fieldwork in the refugee crises in the Middle East and North Africa. Area (London 1969), 49(2), 249–255. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/area.12312</u>
- Povinelli, E.A. (2012). The Will to Be Otherwise/The Effort of Endurance. South Atlantic Quarterly, 111(3), 453–475. https://doi.org/10.1215/00382876-1596236
- Savun, B. & Gineste, C. (2019). From Protection to Persecution: Threat Environment and Refugee Scapegoating. Journal of Peace Research 56(1):88–102.
- Stierl, M. (2020). Reimagining EUrope through the Governance of Migration. International Political Sociology 14(3), 252–269.
- Tong, R. (1998). Feminist Thought: A More Comprehensive Introduction. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.